



COMMUNITY SERVICES

Staff Report

REPORT NO: CS 2023-01

TO: Council

SUBMITTED BY: Sandy Jackson, Director Community Services

PREPARED BY: Sandy Jackson, Director Community Services

REVIEWED BY: Sharon Chambers, CAO
Patrick Kelly, Director Corporate Services, Treasurer

DATE: January 16, 2023

SUBJECT: Third Arena Design RFP Results and Recommendations

RECOMMENDATION:

THAT RFP 2022-36 be awarded to Walter Fedy Inc. based in Kitchener ON, for the design and project management of the addition of a third rink at the Wilmot Recreation Complex (WRC), as per their submission dated November 18, 2023, in the amount of \$616,697.23, plus HST.

SUMMARY:

This report provides detailed background information regarding how the Township reached this point in the process of issuing an RFP for design and project management. The report recommends awarding design of a single pad NHL sized ice surface addition to the Wilmot Recreation Complex with seating for approximately 200-300 spectators and standard arena amenities, as well as administrative office space and storage as per RFP 2022-36 issued in November 2022.

BACKGROUND:

For a number of years, the Township has identified the need for a third ice pad to accommodate the ice demand locally, and to host tournaments attracting tourists to our community. Confirmation of the need for a third pad was outlined and provided to previous

Council in staff report *PFRS 2020-013 Indoor Arena Ice Usage and Needs Analysis Update* attached as Appendix “A”. The recommendations in this report included the following:

That the recommendations in the Indoor Arena Ice Usage and Needs Analysis Update prepared by Monteith Brown Planning Consultants Ltd. be received and;

That staff proceed with Recommendation #2 ‘to undertake further study to determine strategies for delivering a third ice surface’ and;

That funding be included into the 2021 budget as per the existing 10-year Capital Forecast at an estimated cost of \$55,000; and,

That the existing contract with Monteith Brown Planning Consultants Inc. be extended to include strategies for delivering a Third Ice Surface report.

In 2021, Monteith Brown continued the process by completing in-depth user group consultation and site fit-out analysis, and on November 8, 2021, Monteith Brown presented their preliminary findings to Council as outlined in staff report *PFRS 2021-018 Third Ice Pad Update* attached as Appendix “B” which included the following recommendations:

THAT the Third Ice Pad Location Study – Preliminary Findings Summary Report be received;

AND FURTHER THAT staff be directed to initiate a public consultation process to seek comments on the recommended location of the Wilmot Recreation Complex for the third rink site;

AND FURTHER THAT staff be directed to present the public consultation results to Council with a recommendation regarding the preferred site.

The presentation to Council by Monteith Brown provided an overview of user group workshops and interviews conducted by Monteith Brown with representatives from the New Hamburg Junior C Firebirds, New Hamburg Skating Club, New Hamburg Hockey Association, Wilmot Girls Hockey Association, Wilmot Soccer Association, The Community Players, and Wilmot Junior C Lacrosse (see page 4 of Preliminary Findings – Appendix B). Each user group had representatives from their organization participate in an interview with Monteith Brown and were provided the opportunity to express their organizations needs with respect to an additional rink and the impacts it may have on their programming and services.

The preliminary findings report outlined the user group consultation process and information regarding user group preferences for the third ice pad size and location as follows:

- *Users were supportive of the Township’s decision to explore a third ice pad and indicated that the WRC was their preferred location*

- *NHCC was the secondary preference though some suggested it could become a practice rink or dryland training facility*
- *All groups support an NHL-regulation ice pad (200' x 85') with a minimum of 6 dressing rooms, seating typical of a community rink, and adequate storage*
- *The Community Players were engaged and articulated constraints at the NHCC such as lack of rehearsal space, storage, and workshop*
- *Wilmot Soccer Club was also engaged given that expansion of the WRC building may have an impact on fields.*

As outlined above, the report indicated that all groups supported an NHL-regulation ice pad and seating typical of a community rink. A community rink usually holds 200-300 spectators and is used for hockey and skating practices and younger age group games.

This report also recommended the WRC as the preferred site for the additional ice pad which was further supported and confirmed in staff report *PFRS 2021-019 Third Ice Pad Public Consultation Summary Report (attached as Appendix "C")*. This report outlined the results of public consultation from an online survey regarding the preferred location of the third rink and included the following recommendations:

THAT the Third Ice Pad Public Consultation Summary Report be received;

AND FURTHER THAT staff be directed to proceed with a conceptual design and order of magnitude costing for a third ice pad at the Wilmot Recreation Complex site as recommended by consultants Monteith Brown Planning Consultants Ltd. and supported by public consultation;

AND FURTHER THAT staff be directed to present the conceptual design and order of magnitude costing to Council in Q1 of 2022.

PFRS 2022-09 Third Ice Pad and Parks Operations Centre Final Report (attached as Appendix "D") as presented to the previous Council, provided recommendations from Monteith Brown regarding both the third Arena and the Parks Operation site based on their findings during consultation and fit-out analysis as follows:

THAT Report PFRS 2022-09 Third Ice Pad and Parks Operations Centre Final Report, be received for information purposes; and

THAT staff be directed to proceed with plans for hiring a Design / Bid / Build team for the Third Ice Pad project located at the Wilmot Recreation Complex (WRC) as outlined in the 2022 Capital Budget; and

THAT staff be directed to include funds in a future budget for securing a new site and capital funds to construct a Parks Operations Centre.

A motion to amend the recommendations of this report resulted after discussion and concerns were expressed regarding the proximity to the Nachurs Alpine facility on Nafziger Road, as follows:

AND

THAT the motion be amended to include:

Pending a staff report advising on safety concerns related to the proximity to the Nachurs Alpine facility.

Staff report 2022-015, *Third Ice Pad Follow Up Report* (attached as Appendix “E”) was received for information purposes in April 2022 and included operations, emergency planning and training program information in a letter submitted by Nachurs Alpine, input from the lead Architect who designed the original WRC building, and information from the Director of Development Services, Harold O’Krafka who verified the 300m sphere of influence was not a factor, and that no additional analysis was required regarding proximity under the Land Use Compatibility Guidelines.

As a result of this significant research and preliminary reporting regarding, public and user group consultation, location studies and ice demand analysis, staff proceeded in 2022 to issue an RFP for the design and project management of the third arena construction project.

REPORT:

The WRC was identified as the preferred location for the third rink addition due to mechanical, staffing, footprint efficiencies and improved opportunities for tournaments. The final Monteith Brown report included a basic high level conceptual design shown in *Figure 1*, that meets the criteria identified by the user groups and staff for features that would be needed for a new rink. The report recommended a community style rink with limited seating and an NHL standard size ice surface. Space for storage, mechanical equipment, six standard sized dressing rooms and a number of smaller dressing rooms were included in the conceptual floor plan on Page 23 of the report as well as administrative staff office space.

The conceptual design shows the proposed arena being attached to the current exterior wall of the Schout Performance Centre ice pad. The design suggests using the existing main entrance to serve the new arena with a connecting hallway to access dressing rooms and ice for the proposed third pad. The laneway and parking lots would require reconfiguration to accommodate this location. Some soccer pitches may require relocation to an undetermined location to accommodate the additional parking. All of these design decisions will be explored by Walter Fedy if this RFP award is approved.

Figure 3: Wilmot Recreation Complex Conceptual Site Plan



Township of Wilmot – Third Ice Pad Location Study
Monteith Brown Planning Consultants Ltd. | Cornerstone Architecture

Page 22

Figure 1: Third Rink Concept Design

After completion of the user group and community consultation, and the presentation to the former Council, a number of community members requested a design reconsideration for a bowl style arena with seating on all four sides and a capacity of 1,500 seats and 1,800 – 2,000 spectators including standing room. This design will require significantly more square footage and was not fit-tested by Monteith Brown on the WRC site. To consider this option, further study would be required to determine if a different location would be required to accommodate this size of facility. The existing Schout Performance Pad currently has 726 seats on one side of the rink with standing room to a capacity of 1,000-1,200 including the seating. Design challenges with this seating being located over the dressing rooms created site line issues in some seating areas which have been identified by staff and the public as an issue since the facility opened.

During discussion when reports were being presented to Council, statistics were requested with respect to how often the Schout Performance Centre reaches capacity for the existing user groups. Staff confirmed that the only user group to reach capacity is the Jr. C Firebirds who averaged 375 spectators per game during the 2021-2022 regular season based on the statistics shown on the Provincial Junior Hockey League webpage: [PJHL Attendance](#). During

the 2021-2022 playoffs where the Firebirds experienced great success, they averaged 624 spectators per game with four games reaching 700 and one game reaching 1200 spectators. The Firebirds are experiencing another very successful season and staff anticipate reaching capacity at playoff games is highly likely once again. Having said that, these events occur only a few times per year for one organization, usually when the Firebirds are playing a local team such as Tavistock or Wellesley, or when events are sponsored with free admission; and therefore, staff supports the plans to design and build a minor hockey type rink with spectator capacity of 200-300.

RFP Results:

Based on Council direction, the RFP was issued for design of a community style NHL sized rink and seven (7) submissions were received from 25 plan takers.

Proponent	Location
Toms & McNally Design	Hamilton, ON
Stephens Kozak Architects	Edmonton, AL/ Toronto, ON
NGA Architects	Toronto, ON
Masri O Architects	Waterloo, ON
Architectrue49 Inc.	Toronto, ON
Cornerstone Architecture	London, ON
WalterFedy Inc.	Kitchener/Toronto

An internal Selection committee consisting of staff from Community and Corporate Services reviewed and evaluated the proposals based on the following criteria:

Section	Criteria	Description	Points
1	Understanding and Approach	Description of how project is understood and will be undertaken	35
2	Experience and References	Past experience on similar projects and references	15
3	Project Manager and Team	Description of experience and qualifications of project team	25
4	Cost Proposal	Cost to successfully complete project scope	25

The proposals were evaluated and scored for adequacy to address the requested project scope. Following that, the fees were evaluated separately, and a final selection was made based on the comprehensive evaluation criteria.

The proposal received from WalterFedy Inc., is compliant with the specifications outlined within the RFP, and is being recommended for award of contract.

The proposal submitted by Walter Fedy outlined their significant experience with recreation facilities, zero-carbon studies, sustainable designs, and their extensive team of experienced team members. The proposal also spoke to the importance of collaboration with Township staff and user groups in confirming the need for consultation and constant communication to ensure the project is on track. Walter Fedy is an integrated design firm with architecture, mechanical, electrical, structural, and civil engineering; energy and carbon solutions; asset and facilities management; and construction management. The company has been in business for 70 years, with an office in Waterloo Region, and has an excellent reputation in the industry. The project lead has 17 years of experience and will be the principal architect on the project.

Walter Fedy's proposal met all the RFP requirements and out of seven (7) submissions, they scored the highest overall by the evaluation team, made up of three Community Services staff and a representative from Corporate Services. Design review will take place at 60% concept, with a community and user group workshop and online opportunity to review the concept design and provide public input. Results of the consultation will be considered and incorporated during development of the 90% design drawings where feasible and practical. As a result of this approach, and because this is a fairly straightforward addition of an ice pad, versus construction of a full multi-purpose complex, with user group and public consultation included, a community committee is not being recommended for this project.

Once the design is complete and approved by Council, the construction tender will be issued for bidding. Walter Fedy will be responsible for contract administration and oversight of the construction project, including warranty review one year post completion.

ALIGNMENT WITH THE TOWNSHIP OF WILMOT STRATEGIC PLAN:

The development of a third ice pad aligns with the Goal of Community Engagement by involving WRC user groups and the general public in the decision to recommend the WRC as the preferred location for a third ice pad. Completing the Third Ice Pad Study aligns with the Core Values of Health and Wellbeing, Community, Legacy, Accessibility, and Inclusivity and Forward-thinking.

ACTIONS TOWARDS UNITED NATIONS SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS:

Goal 3: Good Health and Wellbeing
Goal 17: Partnerships to Achieve the Goal

FINANCIAL CONSIDERATIONS:

The proposal submitted by Walter Fedy, under RFP 2022-36 included a total upset limit of \$627,551.10 (net of HST rebate). Funding projections for the design and project management for the third rink were estimated at \$881,250 within the Council approved 2022 Capital Budget. The costs for design, project management and full construction were established as follows based on estimates provided in 2021 by Monteith Brown Planning Consultants Inc.

Funding Source	2022	2023	Total
Development Charges	396,500	5,287,500	5,684,000
Debt Financing	484,750	6,462,500	6,947,250
Total Budgeted Funding	881,250	11,750,000	12,631,250

Staff anticipates that inflationary pressures could increase the current construction cost estimate of 11.75M substantially when design work is underway. The construction cost estimates will be updated within future iterations of the Capital Forecast, and within Council reports at the 60% design phase and 90%.

The full operational impacts of this additional ice pad (staffing, operating / maintenance expenses), including the introduction of new annual debt servicing obligations will be further considered within a future comprehensive business plan for this facility. While some of the forecasted incremental costs will be offset via new user fees for the ice rink, and there are significant efficiencies by adding the rink to the existing location at the WRC, a significant amount of future operating costs will need to be funded via future tax levy increases.

ATTACHMENTS:

Appendix "A" PFRS 2020-013 Indoor Arena Usage and Needs Analysis Update
Appendix "B" PFRS 2021-018 Third Ice Pad Study Preliminary Findings Report
Appendix "C" PFRS 2021-019 Third Ice Pad Public Consultation Summary Report
Appendix "D" PFRS 2022-005 Third Arena and Parks Operations Site Final Report
Appendix "E" PFRS 2022-14 Third Ice Pad Location Follow Up Report